Mitchell Gallagher Mitchell Gallagher is Ph.D. candidate at the Wayne State University and achieved a Master of Arts - East Asian Studies (University of Sheffield) and a Bachelor of Arts - Politics (Liverpool John Moores University).

After six years of professional experience in China, his contributions to education were awarded from the Beijing College of Finance & Commerce. He is the author of "Polling to Vaccination Stations: Brexit's Influence on Immunisation Uptake", in *New Perspectives* (2024).

Contact: hj0003@wayne.edu	1
,	

Soft Power Revista euro-americana de teoría e historia de la política y del derecho

Vol. 10(2). Julio-Diciembre 2023 ISSN (online): 2539/2239 ISSN (print): 2389-8232 https://doi.org/10.14718/SoftPower.2023.10.2.4

TWEET WARS: CHINA'S ANTI-US PROPAGANDA THROUGH POLITICAL CARTOONS*

Mitchell Gallagher
Wayne State University

GUERRA DE TUITS: LA PROPAGANDA ANTI EE.UU. DE CHINA A TRAVÉS DE LAS CARICATURAS POLÍTICAS

Abstract

The Chinese Communist Party (CCP) utilises strict censorship to enhance its legitimacy and justify its actions. In the digital age, the internet is a vital platform for disseminating propaganda to domestic and global audiences. Political cartoons transpire as a potent tool, employing parody to transmit political messages. Their effectiveness lies in their faculty to simplify complex ideas, provide humour, and reinforce biases. China's diplomatic approach has shifted to wolf warrior diplomacy, a use of authoritative language to safeguard its interests. Chinese diplomats increasingly use X (formerly Twitter) to convey political messages, and growingly, anti-US sentiments through negative portrayals. This paper reviews the thematic relationship between tweets by the Chinese government and anti-US propaganda political cartoons, exploring how tweets from government officials influence the creation of

^{*} Reception date: 27th March 2023; acceptance date: 30th March 2023. The essay is the issue of a research project carried out within the College of Liberal Arts and Science at Wayne State University

negative portrayals of the US. Employing a content analysis methodology, the study explores tweets and political cartoons, revealing insights into China's soft power and propaganda efforts. It was found that there is a significant correlation between anti-US sentiment expressed through tweets and political cartoons, with variations depending on specific categories of political subject matter and presidential administrations.

Keywords

Chinese Communist Party; propaganda; political cartoons; social media; X (Twitter); soft power

Resumen

El Partido Comunista Chino (PCC) utiliza la censura estricta para aumentar su legitimidad y justificar sus acciones. En la era digital, Internet es una plataforma vital para difundir propaganda a audiencias domésticas y globales. Las caricaturas políticas se revelan como una potente herramienta que recurre a la parodia para transmitir mensajes políticos. Su eficacia reside en su facultad para simplificar ideas complejas, proporcionar humor y reforzar prejuicios. El enfoque diplomático de China ha cambiado hacia la diplomacia del "lobo guerrero", un uso del lenguaje autoritario para salvaguardar sus intereses. Los diplomáticos chinos utilizan cada vez más X (antes Twitter) para transmitir mensajes políticos y, cada vez más, sentimientos antiestadounidenses a través de representaciones negativas. Este artículo examina la relación temática entre los tuits del gobierno chino y las caricaturas políticas de propaganda antiestadounidense, y explora cómo los tuits de los funcionarios del gobierno influyen en la creación de representaciones negativas de Estados Unidos. Empleando una metodología de análisis de contenido, el estudio examina los tuits y las caricaturas políticas, revelando datos sobre el poder blando y los esfuerzos propagandísticos de China. Se constata que existe una correlación significativa entre el sentimiento antiestadounidense expresado a través de tuits y caricaturas políticas, con variaciones según categorías específicas de temas políticos y administraciones presidenciales.

Palabras clave

Partido Comunista Chino; propaganda; caricaturas políticas; medios sociales,;X (Twitter); poder blando

1. Introduction

In the post-Chinese Civil War epoch, punctuated collaboration and discord delineates the historical trajectory of Sino-American engagements. The US refuted the legitimacy of the People's Republic of China's administration and pursued a containment policy toward communist states, leading both to endure an extended interval of diminished direct contact. Notwithstanding, in the early 1970s, the US embarked to ameliorate its ties with China, commencing with President Nixon's visit to Beijing in 1972. Meanwhile, Sino-American relations oscillated, encompassing a mélange of alliance and enmity. The bilateral economic interconnections expanded expeditiously; however, schisms emerged referring to human rights, commerce, and the Taiwan quandary. As the twentyfirst century unfolded, the subtleties and inherent tensions intensified, displaying pronounced strain. The two nations locked heads in a trade war, with unremitting conflicts arising in relation to human rights, intellectual property theft, and maritime altercations in the South China Sea. The COVID-19 pandemic exacerbated extant challenges, with Washington accusing Beijing of paltrily addressing the outbreak's inception and premeditatedly circulating disinformation. While both countries are not presently enmeshed in a cold war, an ostensible trend toward such a backdrop has surfaced, rendering this conclusion reasonable.

Stringent censorship, based on the party's defensive posture to defend its actions and legitimacy to govern, predominantly supports the Chinese Communist Party's (CCP) propaganda structure. In the social media era, the internet developed as a vital channel for disseminating propaganda material related to the party's domestic and foreign policy achievements, as well as the purported deficiencies of democratic politics, to domestic and international audiences. Deploying sardonic cartoons constitutes a salient propaganda technique. Cartoons constitute an efficacious propaganda modality, stemming from an assortment of factors. Among these is the aptitude of cartoons to condense abstruse political notions into simplistic and visually engaging forms readily comprehensible to a diverse populace. Further supplementing their potency is the judicious agency of comedy and satire, optimising the appeal and retention of messages. Cartoons are adept in buttressing preexisting biases and stereotypes, thereby increasing the efficacy of the intended propaganda¹. The swift diffusion of messages through the

¹ In this study, propaganda is defined as a systematic and deliberate form of communication or information dissemination with the intent to manipulate, or influence public attitudes, beliefs and opinions, involving the selective presentation of information with a biased or persuasive slant, to advance a particular agenda or ideology

distribution and vast reach of cartoons across disparate media platforms yields an optimal degree of influence.

Concurrently notoriety for embracing an assertive mode of diplomatic interaction, dubbed "wolf warrior diplomacy"². distinguished by deploying verbal affronts or intimidating language tactics against violators of China's vested interests, relative to territorial claims, economic, and political development. This diplomatic modus operandi witnessed an escalation in modern times. Despite its acclaim, the wolf warrior diplomacy approach led to deleterious repercussions for China's international stature. Although proscribed in China, X (formerly Twitter) became a propitious platform for Chinese diplomats and spokespersons to laud China's accomplishments and react to contemporary events. As Sino-American political relations continue deteriorating, it has become increasingly commonplace for Chinese diplomats to circulate anti-US³ messages and negative impressions of the US through tweets. The present study is committed to investigation the nature and frequency of political cartoons casting the US in an unfavourable light, with an aim to obtain a greater understanding regarding the degree to which the Chinese government and stateaffiliated media are synchronised in their corresponding messaging.

My study is inspired by current US-China relations, marked by growing consternations over propaganda influence on public attitudes. While past studies surveyed propaganda and political cartoons, this paper adopts a unique approach by focusing on the Chinese government and stateaffiliated media coordination. The prospective implications are substantial, as the findings could offer significant revelations into the Chinese government's communication ploys and their impact on US perceptions. This paper aims to add to the current literature on propaganda and political cartoons by obtaining innovative understandings of the correlation between the Chinese government and stateaffiliated media and their impact on anti-US outlook. In doing so, this paper aims to bridge a void in the existing academic work on political communication. While prior research has explored miscellaneous facets of propaganda and political cartoons, there remains a scarcity of comprehensive analyses pertaining to the coordinated efforts of the Chinese government and stateaffiliated media through political cartoons. By

² 'Wolf warrior' diplomacy is named after a 2017 patriotic film series renowned for its confrontational and pugnacious style with diplomats and government ministers forcefully rebuking any perceived critiques of the CCP and its decision-making.
³ Anti-US propaganda is defined as a deliberate, systematic effort using communication channels to depict the United States negatively. This form of propaganda central to the study, refers to aims to shape public perception, generate distrust, and promote hostility. Such propaganda often encompasses exaggerations and distortions to serve political agendas, and is commonly used to influence public opinion both domestically and internationally.

highlighting this aspect of Chinese political communication, subsequent findings are expected enhance our understanding of how nations strategically employ visual media to influence global public opinion. What is more, this study not only aspires to discover the mechanics of Chinese political cartoon propaganda, but also to add to a broader discourse on international communication dynamics. In an era marked by intensified global information flows and diplomatic strategies, the discoveries gleaned from this research hold the potential to inform not only academic circles but also policymakers and practitioners in the field of international relations.

2. Political Cartoons

A pervasive element within editorial pages of magazines and newspapers, political cartoons serve as a medium to communicate delicate political predicaments from satirical images, summarising current events in a humorous visual form. Academic literature on political cartoons contains inquiries into their historical and cultural significance to direct public perception, utility in propaganda and satire, and efficacy in delivering political messages. Cartoon analyses observe their visual and rhetorical strategies, as well as their representation of complicated political matters, informed by a diverse cluster of disciplinary perspectives in communication studies, political science, sociology, and art history. Cartoons signify the political climate and future plans of politicians (Edwards, 1993), with the importance of language functioning as a means of sharing attitudes and developing cognitive and social aspects. Editorial cartoons are instrumental in agendasetting Walker (2003), functioning as a gadget for society's dominant elite, and reflecting the interests of media proprietorship. Cartoons can transcend mere commentary of political actors, events, and circumstances. Rather, their engagement reflects a profound acumen and cognisance of the political landscape in features and nuances by uncovering currents of hegemonic contention and the exercise of power dynamics (Ghilzai, 2020). A hegemonic appearance, epitomising ascendancy or dominion of a singular entity or societal faction over its counterparts, is emblematically encapsulated within their visual narratives. In this symbolic scope, cartoons adeptly articulate strenuous contestations and stratagems of political entities in their fervent pursuit of ascendancy and status within the political arena.

Political cartoons wield an unparalleled influence on their readers, frequently traversing cognitive barriers to exert a persuasive effect on opinions with those in positions of authority possessing an acumen for deciphering the covert messages

embedded within cartoons (Navasky, 2013). Contemporaneous political cartooning iteration is oriented by two objectives: amusement and edification (Kemnitz, 1973), with the strategic intent of tempering the inherent fervour in political sentiments. Streicher (1967) the literary satire concept finds its visual counterpart in pictorial art as 'caricature' or 'cartoon'. Lampooning conventionally involves presenting human vices or absurdities to deride or taunt individuals; conversely, graphic caricatures employ visual representation to satirise, and within the domain of political cartoons, the objective is to satirically deride, deconstruct, or unveil individuals, collectives, or entities embroiled within politics or society. Employing cartoons holds significance in illustrating the overriding political discourse climate and prospective agendas, involving individual interests of politicians as well as the broader national context (Edwards, 1993), with language functions acting as an avenue for conveying cognitive and social maturation, together with expressing distinct standpoints. Political cartoons fulfil multiple functions, including entertainment, aggression mitigations, agendasetting and framing (DeSousa & Medhurst, 1982), as well as defining political policies and historical narratives. Nonetheless, viewed from an alternative standpoint (Diamond, 2002), political cartoons have sustained a presence for well over two centuries; but this genre has encountered challenges in attaining genuine prominence.

Although sporadic cartoons documented the quandaries faced by CCP, these were eclipsed by portrayals of quotidian existence. Political cartoons appraisal underscores several techniques enacted by cartoonists to express their intended meanings (Langeveld, 1981), including diligent selection, misrepresentation, commentary, and prognostication. Growing anti-US emotions and turbocharged Chinese nationalism outlined three strands (Xu, 1998); patriotic education pointing out China's historical humiliation, Chinese intellectuals' reversion to traditional studies for solutions to domestic challenges, and a concatenation of events, including China's economic expansion, the Yinhe incident, the unsuccessful Olympic Games bid, and the US' Taiwan policy. Chinese nationalism was propelled by these factors, concomitant with anti-American thoughts in China. Throughout history, propaganda is utilised as a contrivance to distribute disinformation and fallacies. The internet fostered the evolution and expansion of such practices, exacerbating misinformation proliferation. Studies into Chinese propaganda revealed the government substantially raised investment in propaganda initiatives (Edney, 2014), particularly via state media organs, Xinhua and China Central Television. The basic argument for the Chinese government's propaganda campaign is to elevate its global standing, negate adverse narratives about China, and advance its interests. Chinese propaganda aspires to maintain

national political unity and empower CCP by broadcasting a favourable party and government image. Propaganda efforts are tailored to domestic and international onlookers, with contrasting messages and tactics deployed accordingly. Political scientists will be acquainted with the soft power theory (Nye, 2004), i.e. capacity to allure and coax as instrumental in influencing the preferences, behaviours, and decisions of others without resorting to force or coercion, can surely identify some of these elements in the so far recounted practices of the CCP. The partystate's bolstering soft power objective, akin to the broader work of the propaganda apparatus (Edney, 2012), incorporates policies targeting domestic and international spheres. The partystate views domestic and international political circumstances as interrelated and mutually influential. Successful foreign propaganda and soft power will further the partystate's realisation of domestic aspirations, while compelling domestic propaganda, including efforts to fuel its "cultural soft power", will fortify domestic cohesion, endowing China's international voice with augmented credibility and leverage.

3. Propaganda and Political Communication

Autocratic regimes frequently turn to propaganda as an instrument for shaping perceptions and steering sociopolitical outcomes. Propaganda targeting external audiences often reverberates within domestic spheres, tightening the autocrat's grip on power as regimes curate a version of reality framing their leadership as indomitable and righteous. Propaganda onto foreign terrains enables a normalisation of autocratic governance models. By promoting their successes, whether genuine, exaggerated, or fabricated, autocratic regimes can engage in soft power competition with the ultimate goal to mould mass opinion to view autocracy not as an aberration, but as a legitimate, effective form of governance. Autocracies habitually face an asymmetry of information, where dissenting voices within the nation are stifled but international criticisms persist. According to scholarly work provided by Shambaugh (2007), infrastructural ecosystems for the transmission and dissemination of propaganda within the People's Republic of China are inexorably subsumed under the bureaucratic aegis of CCP's propaganda bureau. By operating propaganda against external entities, autocratic regimes can obfuscate or dilute counternarratives that could threaten regime stability. Epistemological frameworks by Huang (2018) and Wedeen (2015), show that a distinct subcategory of propaganda exists, one diverging from conventional telos of persuasion, and instead instils trepidation. Academic conceptualisations put forth by Carter and Carter (2022) and Little (2017) distinguishes a specialised form of hard propaganda, which departs

markedly from conventional epistemological parameters that privilege credibility and persuasive efficacy. Hard power obviates the customary objective of engendering belief or conviction through the deployment of credible and convincing narratives. Propaganda possesses a dual role in autocracies (Mattingly & Yao, 2022), in effectiveness in manipulating anger and antiforeign sentiment by demonstrating propaganda can surpass ideology, serving also to strategically modulate emotional states in line with regime objectives.

Xi Jinping championed the diffusion of Chinese ideas during the National Propaganda and Ideology Work Conference on August 19, 2013, expounding on a calculated approach to propaganda and global messaging. Xi stressed an exhortation for increased ingenuity in China's transnational outreach under the "telling China's story well" (Jiǎng hǎo zhōngguó gùshì) slogan. In an empirical investigation, Huang and Wang (2019) revealed Chinese diplomatic agencies employed interactive methods on X, utilising @mentions and purposefully incorporating hashtags, to project Chinese political views and narratives in a varied manner, thereby establishing an interconnected online discourse. China's profile suffered deleterious detriments due to the COVID-19 pandemic, as the country initially faced criticism for its crisis management with accusations of withholding vital information. Beijing undermined its stature as a responsible global actor by tardily disclosing information to the international community and lacking transparency regarding case and fatality numbers. In a prominent analysis, Ayson (2022) found that China uses political cartoons to amend its image, identifying ubiquitous anti-Americanism themes. The results reflect China's commitment to preserving its face-saving culture and nationalistic narrative while simultaneously addressing the deteriorating US-China relations. China's presence on X is a subject of scholarly investigation. Studies by Huang and Wang (2019) and Jia and Li (2020) revealed that China's state news media made their initial foray onto X as early as 2009. Simultaneously, China's diplomats began utilising Twitter as a diplomatic tool in 2010. However, by late 2018, the number of active Twitter accounts representing Chinese diplomats was notably limited, with fewer than 20 such accounts (Huang & Wang, 2019). Stockmann's (2013) research highlights that Chinese propaganda serves a specific purpose —to influence public opinion on particular issues with the ultimate goal of expanding the government's policy space.

However, amidst this rich literature, there remains a conspicuous gap that warrants additional exploration. To gain a greater understanding of contemporary political communication, it is critical to investigate the synchronicity and alignment

between Chinese government tweets and the content of political cartoons. This gap demonstrates a need for a detailed analysis of how Chinese government tweets and political cartoons intersect, whether they share a correlational relationship in their messaging, and how this synchronisation impacts perceptions, especially in the context of deteriorating US-China relations.

4. Research Question

This investigation aims to explicate the thematic relationship between tweets from Chinese government ministers, with a unique regard to anti-US propaganda political cartoons promulgated by Chinese state media. As a fundamental precursor to any scholarly exploration intent on probing Chinese government and state media sentiment directed at the US within the social media domain, the illustration of "anti-US" tweets is of overriding importance. Within the framework, anti-US tweets are interpreted as expressions imbued with negative impressions geared towards the US, its policies, or its cultural values. Tweets may exteriorise US foreign policy, military intervention, economic practice, or social norm opprobrium, and evincing support for adversarial countries or groups esteemed antithetical to US interests. The demarcation of anti-US mindset is contingent upon context; thus, researchers are enjoined to delineate and operationalise coding categories with unerring exactitude when conducting content analyses of social media platforms. Given the booming gravity of social media within public discourse and political communication, anti-US opinion studies on X and analogous platforms, assumes academic significance by proffering knowledge into the widely held attitudes of the Chinese government towards the US.

By perusing tweet content, political cartoons, and assorted media sources, this paper aims to illuminate the eclectic relationship between social media, politics, and propaganda within the purview of USChina relations. The Chinese government perennially upheld a non-interference public posture in other nations' domestic matters, a consistent position conveyed to the international community. However, situations arose wherein the Chinese government and stateaffiliated media engrossed in trenchant verbal and pictorial rejoinders to perceived provocations. This digression from its public stance is linked to China's efforts to enrich its soft power and to offset its unfavourable renderings. While a non-interference policy benefitted China well in its own diplomacy, its surging global authority and attaining global superpower status aspirations, required a bolder approach in responding to hazards to its national interests. Consequently, the Chinese government and stateaf-

filiated media assumed a more proactive role in image construction and messaging, employing political cartoons as a means to attain this objective. An analysis into Chinese government tweets and published political cartoons confers awareness into the levels of coordination among the Chinese government's messaging and propaganda techniques across diverse mediums, ergo serving as an efficacious instrument for policymakers and analysts in acquiring an understanding towards China's soft power and propaganda initiatives, as well as prospective ramifications thereof for global politics. The following hypothesis is put forth: *The frequency and content of Tweets by Chinese government ministers will exert a significant positive impact on the generation of anti-US propaganda political cartoons*.

5. Theoretical Framework

The theoretical grounding of this paper rests on the interplay of soft power, propaganda, and political communication. Nye's (2004) concept of soft power, the ability of states to influence others through attraction and persuasion rather than coercion, facilitates in our understanding of China's global communication strategy. Nations can affect international narratives not only through their tangible assets but also by leveraging intangible assets such as culture, political values, and foreign policies. Propaganda, as explored by Edney and Shambaugh has a paramount connection with soft power. Autocratic regimes usually use propaganda as a tool for domestic consolidation of power and for constructing narratives that suit their international ambitions. Political cartoons, as simplified yet potent mediums, act as conduits that can efficiently transfer the essence of these propagandised messages to the masses, as highlighted by Ghilzai and Walker. However, a gap exists in the academic literature. While much has been explored concerning propaganda and political communication, limited work has investigated governmental communications on modern platforms like X and their influence on mediums like political cartoons, particularly in the context of Sino-American relations. By juxtaposing the Chinese government's tweets with anti-US propaganda cartoons, this research aspires to unearth the symbiotic relationship that might exist between these two seemingly disparate mediums. I position this interrelation within China's evolving diplomacy, particularly its Wolf Warrior approach and its ambitions to sculpt global narratives in its favour. In justifying this theoretical framework, one must acknowledge the complex nature of political communication in the digital age. A holistic understanding requires considering not just traditional media but also newer platforms and how they might intersect and feed

into one another. This synergy between different channels of communication, coupled with the overarching strategies of soft power and propaganda, tenders a lens to discern China's diplomatic and communicative tactics in the global arena.

6. Variables & Data

The decision to designate biweeks as the constituent units of analysis derives from the exigency to survey trajectories and patterns germane to tweet frequency and content dispersed from members of the Chinese Foreign Affairs Department, and political cartoons. Biweeks deliver a more varied and granular dataset compared to shorter time intervals like daily analysis. The publication process for political cartoons involves multiple steps, from ideation to creation and eventual publication. Conducting a biweekly analysis accounts for the expected lag between posting a tweet and publishing a corresponding political cartoon. For this analysis, 76 were computed, spanning from 2020 to 2023, thus enabling the capture of a more extensive depiction into the dynamics and interchange between the variables over an extended temporal frame. This methodological decision is consonant with the best practices in research methodology, with the need to select apposite units of analysis congruous with the research question and objectives in order to attain precise and valid findings.

The independent variable comprises of tweets released by China's Foreign Affairs Department's members, which will be collated from the accounts of Hua Chunying (@SpokespersonCHN), Foreign Ministry Information Department Minister, and Zhao Lijian (@zlj517), who occupied the role of Deputy Director-General within the Information Department. Both individuals actively use X to publicise official statements and reply to worldwide events. Hua Chunying and Zhao Lijian, hold prominent positions within China's Foreign Affairs Department, and their X activities are indicative of the Chinese government's approach to international communication. With high-profile positions and a significant number of followers, they frequently engage in tweeting, making their accounts focal points for conveying the official stance of the Chinese government. Moreover, their active presence in the media spotlight further solidifies their role as key representatives of China's foreign policy and diplomatic efforts. The research will extract tweets from the Spokesperson's 发言人 办公室 (fā yán rén bàn gōng shì), the official X account of China's Ministry of Foreign Affairs Spokesperson's Office, tasked with communicating the Chinese government's official viewpoint on a panoply of global issues, as well as addressing queries from the media. To accurately gauge the variables' impact on the outcome in question, I will systematically amass and analyse data on the number and content of tweets originating from

these sources on a biweekly basis, thus enabling the detection of any detectable patterns and trends, as well as the production of credible findings supplementing our understanding of the connection between variables.

The dependent variables are political cartoons. In measuring the cartoons' volume and substance, data will be collated from the cartoons published biweekly in Chinese stateaffiliated media outlets. The People's Daily and Global Times are valuable sources for analysing political cartoons, both recognised as major Chinese stateowned newspapers. The People's Daily, as the official newspaper of CCP's Central Committee, is regarded as an authoritative source proffering official government policies and viewpoints on national and international issues, rendering the paper as an ideal source for understanding the Chinese government's official stance on a wide array of subjects and for analysing the published cartoons. *The Global Times* is renowned for its nationalist and anti-Western editorial outlook, operating a more confrontational tone. By dissecting political cartoons content, we can accrue an understanding into how China's propaganda apparatus casts the US in a pejorative light. The coding categories for the independent variables and dependent are, as follows;

- Coercion
- Democracy
- Military & Weapons
- National Security
- Human Rights
- Territory & Sovereignty
- Economy & Trade
- Social Issues
- Environment
- Public Health
- Individuals/Administration

The coding categories for the independent and dependent variables are determined by reading tweets and examining subsequent cartoons related to the US-China relationship. Each individual tweet and cartoon will be assigned at least one coding classification referring directly to the US either through text, or visual reference to the American flag, individual institutions and/or politicians. While the primary approach was to assign a single, most relevant code to each tweet or cartoon, a few instances required double coding. However, such cases were relatively rare and typically arose

when the content exhibited a significant overlap of themes or messages. The decision to double code in these rare instances was justified by the need to accurately capture the multifaceted nature of the content. This process ensured that neither theme was overlooked or underrepresented in the analysis, but above all, to uphold the integrity and comprehensiveness of the coding process when a single code would have inadequately reflected the content.

To guarantee consistency in the coding process, these clear definitions and guidelines are established to accommodate a systematic approach in sorting of themes and substance presented amongst the variables. Each tweet and cartoon will be manually checked without any software to increase accuracy, flexibility, and a more profound interpretation that will lead to more resolute and meaningful analyses. I meticulously carried out the coding process to ensure both intercoder and intracoder reliability. To maintain reliability throughout the process, I established clear definitions and guidelines for coding, allowing for a systematic approach in categorising themes and substance related to references to the US, including textual mentions and visualisations involving the American flag, individual institutions, and politicians. This approach increased the precision of the analysis. Attention was given to contextual factors such as framing techniques, textual analysis in the cartoons and captions, visual elements and character representations employed in the tweets. These granular details were crucial in capturing the subtle nuances in the presentation of anti-US propaganda. The coding groups held significant relevance within the context of the US-China relationship, and these themes were consistently expressed in political spoofs found in the tweets and cartoons analysed.

- **Coercion** involves the use of force, threats, or intimidation to dominate or exert control over convictions and behaviour of individuals or states.
- Democracy emerges as a key coding genre for anti-US propaganda analysis, owing to its intimate association with the values and principles undergirding the US' political system.
- *Military and weaponry* fashion recurrent themes in anti-US propaganda, as they are inextricably linked to the US's global military presence and foreign policy. Anti-US propaganda recurrently portrays the US military and weaponry as bellicose, violent, and imperialistic, casting the US as a menace to global peace.
- *National security* representation in anti-US propaganda looks to sustain pejorative stereotypes of the US as an aggressive, malevolent state, aiming to galvanise antipathy to US national security policies and actions.

- A common manoeuvre in anti-US propaganda germane to *human rights* is to publicise the US' historical trajectory of colonialism, slavery, and discrimination against marginalised cohorts.
- *Territorial and sovereignty* matters refer to a continually operated ploy to underscore US military interference or support for extrinsic military actions culminating in contraventions of other countries' sovereignty.
- Economic policies and dilemmas recurrently act as sources of tension and conflict and may be sketched in political cartoons to deride the US government's economic stewardship and its extant state.
- Social issues, individual rights and political ideology, are integral components
 influencing the global perception of the US, which may impinge China's own
 image and reputation.
- *Environmental* concerns increasingly assumed a central role in global affairs, particularly relating to climate change and sustainability. Political cartoons may depict these challenges as a conduit for dispensing commentary on the environmental policies or actions by the US government.
- **Public health**, a routinely exploited strategy, is to emphasise the US' substandard response to COVID-19. This may refer to mismanagement, misleading information propagation, and insufficient aid for disadvantaged groups allegations. Propaganda messages repeatedly claim the US' pandemic handling was prompted by politics rather than science, and the US' global standing in public health was impeded by its domestic failures.
- Political cartoons may also concentrate on explicit *individuals or politicians* embroiled in US-China relations, either as a means to censure their actions or highlight their role in shaping dyadic interactions between the two.

7. Methodology

A range of statistical techniques are employed to analyse the data and address the research question. These methods are guided by the need to answer distinct inquiries and to bestow a lucid understanding of the phenomena under investigation. I utilised descriptive statistics to facilitate the initial examination of the created dataset, and to quantify and evaluate tweets, cartoons, and their relevant classifications. This initial step aims to provide a foundational overview of the data's distribution and characteristics. A chisquare and Cramer's V analysis will assess the correlation between tweet classifications from the Chinese government and the varieties of political cartoons published by Chinese stateaffiliated media.

This analysis aimed to identify any significant associations between variables and insights into the relationships between different aspects of our data, and to answer the research question of whether there is a relationship between content tweeted by Chinese government officials and political cartoons subsequently published.

To enhance the robustness of the findings, I focused on the temporal periods during President Biden and President Trump's terms in office as control variables. Recognising that the president in power may influence anti-US sentiment and the production of political cartoons, this control variable allows to assess whether presidential policies or statements had an impact on our observed associations. The selection of these statistical techniques was driven by the specific research questions they were intended to address.

Several possible confounding variables must be considered in the analysis. The political climate in China, marked by changes in leadership, policies, and diplomatic relations during the terms of President Biden and President Trump, could significantly influence the content and tone of both political cartoons and tweets, potentially confounding their relationship. The occurrence of significant international events like trade disputes, geopolitical conflicts, or global crises might coincide with the study's time periods, impacting tweet classifications and the themes of political cartoons. Another confounding factor is how Chinese stateaffiliated media's media coverage, editorial decisions, and propaganda efforts can configure public perception and henceforth affect the content of tweets and political cartoons. Other domestic political events beyond the actions and statements of US presidents, such as changes in government policies or leadership transitions, may contribute to variations in anti-US sentiment and the production of political cartoons, adding complexity to the analysis.

8. Results

Table1: Descriptive Statistics for Tweets

	Observations	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Coercion	36	1	7	1.97	1.383
Democracy	76	0	7	0.42	1.07
Military & Weapons	44	0	15	3.27	3.6
National Security	43	1	8	2.07	1.8

	Observations	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Human Rights	40	1	5	1.9	1.15
Territory & Sover- eignty	37	1	21	2.7	3.8
Economy & Trade	43	1	9	2.4	1.8
Social Issues	34	1	5	2.06	1.25
Environment	16	1	2	1.2	0.4
Public Health	35	1	7	1.6	1.2
Individuals & Ad- ministration	36	1	9	2.5	2.007

Note: The dataset was generated by the author for the purpose of this study.

From the empirical data (Table 1) one can be establish an overwhelming proportion of anti-US tweets by Chinese governmental officials correspond to democracy. The impetuses behind these actions are manifold and subject to numerous interpretations. One feasible supposition surmises that the Chinese government detects democracy as an existential threat to its political system, thereby demanding attempts to discredit democracy. As an authoritarian regime, China precludes political dissent and transparent democratic processes, interpreting democratic tenets as possible challenges to its dominion. Spawning anti-US and democracy tweets may work to bolster the Chinese government's political legitimacy. A substitutive and conceivable motive suggests the US' support of democracy is a venture to exert control and influence over other sovereign states. In this context, the CCP pushes to neutralise US influence by subverting the credibility of democracy as a feasible political system. By posting anti-US tweets in connection to democracy, the Chinese government dedicates itself to corrode the US' image as a democratic paradigm for other states to venerate. Furthermore, the CCP may adjudge promoting democracy as an intrusion into its domestic affairs, hence instigating efforts to retaliate by spotlighting deficiencies within the US democratic system. This strategy could be inferred as a means for Beijing to counter castigations of its own political system by exposing shortcomings in the US' democratic apparatus.

The inducement underlying the Chinese government's tweets pertaining to military & weapons, national security, and human rights may be ambiguous, but intertwined. One logical theory is that the Chinese government works to consolidate its national security policies and refine its global standing by propagating its viewpoint on these

affairs via social media. These areas of interest are considered essential to China's interests and sovereignty; thus, it is persuasive the government hopes to advocate its outlook on these matters with a social media presence. Beijing may contend its military and weapons policies are integral to safeguarding national security and preserving human rights, particularly amidst external threats to its own security. For example, CCP may sense its efforts to suppress ethnic and religious minorities in Xinjiang to maintain national security and stability, which Beijing deems indispensable.

Furthermore, the Chinese government's tweets in respect to military & weapons, national security, and human rights may be aimed at shaping public's general consensus, and resisting negative narratives communicated by other nationstates, notably the US. Beijing may deem Washington as a rival and antagonist, who seeks to neutralise its influence, by transmitting messages on these topics via social media. Tweets surrounding military & weapons, national security, and human rights may be components of an overarching blueprint to advance China's interests and agenda within the global arena. These issues' interdependency suggests CCP judges them as interconnected and requisite to safeguarding its interests and sovereignty. Descriptive statistical methodologies to survey political cartoons published in stateaffiliated media will be provided. This analysis will produce insights into the prevailing political climate and mood apropos specific issues. Table 2 summarises the descriptive statistical measures for our examination.

Table 2: Descriptive Statistics for Political Cartoons published

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Coercion	33	0	4	1.42	0.867
Democracy	76	0	11	0.39	1.44
Military & Weapons	49	0	11	2.6	2.52
National Security	24	1	7	1.75	1.35
Human Rights	33	1	3	1.3	0.58
Territory & Sovereignty	25	0	5	1.64	1.22
Economy & Trade	55	0	6	1.94	1.25
Social Issues	37	0	4	1.48	0.837
Environment	13	1	2	1.15	0.375
Health	41	1	9	2.4	1.88
Individuals & Administration	44	0	5	1.77	1.17

This scholarly investigation's empirical outcomes unveil recurrently broached themes in anti-US political cartoons include democracy, military and weaponry, economic and trade matters, individual and administrative figures, and public health-related matters. These revelations may be germinating from the prominence of these ideas within contemporaneous political dialogues and the collective consciousness. The profuse political cartoons' prevalence centred on democracy implies this question makes for a noteworthy focus and apprehension for the propaganda arsenal, potentially due to the recent political evolutions and discourses pertaining to democratic principles and institutions. The accentuation on military and weaponry could be indicative of the persisting US-Sino geopolitical frictions and hostilities, entailing various arms races and military escalations. The concentration on economic and commercial affairs may epitomise pecuniary issues in contemporaneous politics, such as US dollar prominences and menaces to decouple from China. Analogously, the attention on individual and administrative figures might signify public scrutiny and upbraiding of political dignitaries and their respective policies. Public health matters within political cartoons may be indicative of the ongoing global health calamities and the political reactions to these crises. In contrast, a relatively diminished frequency of political cartoons associated with themes of coercion, human rights, national security, social issues, environmental turmoil, and territorial and sovereign matters may exemplify the circumscribed public attention and discourse on these topics within the current political landscape.

Table 3: Chi Square Tests & Symmetric Measures

	Pearson Chi-Square	Df	Phi	Cramer's V	P-Value	N
Coercion	10.495	15	0.76	0.441	0.788	18
Democracy	94.521	25	1.11	0.5	0.001**	76
Military & Weap- ons	212.256	96	2.43	0.858	0.001**	36
National Security	23.080	18	1.20	0.693	0.188	16
Human Rights	44.159	8	1.30	0.922	0.001**	26
Territory & Sover- eignty	12.000	9	1.22	0.707	0.213	8
Economy & Trade	49.116	30	1.13	0.508	0.015*	38
Social Issues	18.756	16	0.92	0.462	0.281	22

	Pearson Chi-Square	Df	Phi	Cramer's V	P-Value	N
Environment	6.519	1	0.77	0.7	0.011*	11
Public Health	13.310	15	0.76	0.44	0.578	23
Individuals & Ad- ministration	19.532	20	0.92	0.461	0.488	23

Note: Coding categories are explained in the text. p < .05 *p < .01

This scholarly investigation's empirical outcomes unveil recurrently broached themes in anti-US political cartoons include democracy, military and weaponry, economic and trade matters, individual and administrative figures, and public health-related matters. These revelations may emanate from the prominence of these ideas within contemporaneous political dialogues and the collective consciousness. The abundant presence of political cartoons focused on democracy implies this question makes for a noteworthy focus and apprehension for the propaganda arsenal, potentially due to the recent political evolutions and discussions pertaining to democratic principles and institutions. The emphasis on military and weaponry may portend the enduring nature of US-Sino geopolitical frictions and hostilities, entailing various arms races and military escalations. The concentration on economic and commercial affairs may epitomise pecuniary issues in contemporaneous politics, such as US preeminence with the dollar and menaces to decouple from China. Analogously, the attention on individual and administrative figures might signify public scrutiny and upbraiding of political dignitaries and their respective policies. Public health matters within political cartoons may be indicative of the ongoing global health calamities and the political reactions to these crises. In contrast, a relatively diminished frequency of political cartoons associated with themes of coercion, human rights, national security, social issues, environmental turmoil, and territorial and sovereign matters may exemplify the circumscribed public attention and discourse on these topics within the current political landscape. The empirical outcomes unearthed herein suggest the presence of a correlative link between tweets posted by Chinese governmental accounts and political cartoons publicised in state-affiliated media (Table 3). Among categories, democracy, military & weaponry, human rights, economy & trade, and environmental concerns all reported a degree of significance evidenced by their respective p-values. Given the results, which indicate

statistical insignificance in conjunction with a high Cramer's V, one infers a substantial association between the variables. But proportion of this association does not meet prescribed thresholds for statistical significance. Strikingly, observed strong association may be vulnerable to stochastic irregularities.

Table 4: Correlation (Democracy)

		Democracy (Tweets)	Democracy (Cartoons)
Democracy (Tweets)	Pearson Correla- tion	1	0.261
	Sig. (2-tailed)		0.023*
	N	76	76
Democracy (Cartoons)	Pearson Correla- tion	0.261	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.023	
	N	76	76

^{*} Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

Table 5: Correlation (Military & Weapons)

		Military & Weapons (Tweets)	Military & Weapons (Cartoons)
Military & Weapons (Tweets)	Pearson Correlation	1	0.953**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		0.001**
	N	44	36
Military & Weapons (Cartoons)	Pearson Correlation	0.953**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.001**	
	N	36	49

^{**} Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 6: Correlation (Human Rights)

		Human Rights (Tweets)	Human Rights (Cartoons)
Human Rights (Tweets)	Pearson Correlation	1	0.829
	Sig. (2-tailed)		0.001**
	N	40	26
Human Rights (Cartoons)	Pearson Correlation	0.829	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.001**	
	N	26	33

^{**} Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 7: Correlation (Economy & Trade)

		Economy & Trade (Tweets)	Economy & Trade (Cartoons)
Economy & Trade (Tweets)	Pearson Correlation	1	0.44
	Sig. (2-tailed)		0.006**
	N	43	38
Economy & Trade (Cartoons)	Pearson Correlation	0.44	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.006**	
	N	38	55

^{**} Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

		Environment (Tweets)	Environment (Cartoons)
Environment (Tweets)	Pearson Correlation	1	.77
	Sig. (2-tailed)		0.006**
	N	16	11
Environment	Pearson	.77	1

0.006**

11

13

Table 8: Correlation (Environment)

Correlation

Sig. (2-tailed)

(Cartoons)

The principal logic for this phenomenon can be ascribed to an insufficient sample size or excessive variability within the dataset. The presence of a high Cramer's V and an insignificant p-value necessitates a sophisticated interpretation of the findings, highlighting the importance of a thorough inquiry into the data to attain a more thorough comprehension into the nature of the association between the variables. A bivariate regression analysis will dig deeper into the scale of the statistical link between variables demonstrated as statistically significant. While these findings signify a correlation between tweets and political cartoons, it's important to note that correlation does not necessarily imply causation. Further research should consider the limitations of the sample size and seek to employ larger sample sizes to strengthen validity. The generalisability of this study's results to other contexts or regions may require careful consideration, as factors influencing political cartoons and tweets may vary in different geopolitical landscapes.

The extant scholarly inquiry worked to assess the thematic interrelationship between content in tweets and recent cartoons, operationalised through five coding categories within the independent variable of interest: democracy, military & weapons, human rights, economy & trade, and environment. Pearson correlation coefficients were calculated to ascertain the magnitude and tendency of the association. The results show sizeable variances in the strength of the Pearson correlation coefficients across the different genres. Remarkably, military & weapons was the strongest positive correlation in cartoon content,

^{**} Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

substantiated by a Pearson correlation coefficient of .953, followed in proximity by human rights at .829. A moderately sound correlation was discerned between environment and the content of the corresponding cartoons, with a Pearson correlation coefficient of .77. In contradistinction, democracy revealed a weak correlation with a Pearson correlation coefficient totalling .261, while economy & trade displayed a moderate correlation with a .440 coefficient. This scholarly inquiry worked to assess the thematic interrelationship between content in tweets and recent cartoons, operationalised through five coding categories within the independent variable of interest: democracy (Table 4), military & weapons (Table 5), human rights (Table 6), economy & trade (Table 7), and environment (Table 8). Pearson correlation coefficients were calculated to ascertain the magnitude and tendency of the association. The results show sizeable variances in the strength of the Pearson correlation coefficients across the different genres

Fluctuations in the strength of the Pearson correlation coefficients among various categories may be attributable to the nature of the content under investigation, as well as the innate sociopolitical and economic determinants. The pronounced positive correlation between military & weapons and cartoon content can be reasonably connected to the pervasiveness of portrayals of former military disputes and weaponry in political cartoons. Similarly, the vigorous correlation between human rights and the cartoons presumably mirrors the prominence of alleged human rights breaches as a widespread focus in Chinese political cartoons. The moderate correlation between environment and the content of the corresponding cartoons can be accredited to the escalating significance of ecoconundrums in political discourse and political cartoons lambasting the US for neglecting its obligations to address climate change. Inversely, the correlation between democracy and corresponding cartoon content can be tentatively explained by visually representing faltering democratic institutions and processes.

Table 9: Controlling for President Trump

	Pearson Chi-Square	Df	Phi	Cramer's V	P-Value	N
Coercion	0.480	4	.200	0.141	0.975	12
Democracy	0.125	2	.58	0.58	0.940	37
Military & Weapons	20.000	6	1.414	1.0	0.003**	10
National Security	9.333	10	1.20	0.816	0.501	7
Human Rights	8.000	2	1	1	0.018*	8
Territory & Sovereignty	1.673	6	0.213	0.15	0.947	37

	Pearson Chi-Square	Df	Phi	Cramer's V	P-Value	N
Economy & Trade	14.000	6	1.0	0.7	0.03*	14
Social Issues	4.800	6	0.775	0.548	0.57	8
Environment	3.000	1	1	1	0.083	3
Public Health	12.750	20	0.86	0.43	0.88	17
Individuals & Administration	9.750	12	0.866	0.5	0.638	13

^{*} Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

Table 10: Controlling for President Biden

	Pearson Chi- Square	Df	Phi	Cramer's V	P-Value	N
Coercion	9.37	10	.79	0.559	0.323	15
Democracy	94.521	25	1.11	0.5	0.001***	76
Military & Weapons	142.86	96	2.34	0.82	0.001***	26
National Security	11.143	8	1.1	0.787	0.194	9
Human Rights	28.000	8	1.2	0.882	0.001***	18
Territory & Sovereignty	8.000	6	1.4	1	0.238	4
Economy & Trade	34.88	30	1.2	0.54	0.247	24
Social Issues	11.813	8	0.92	0.65	0.160	14
Environment	3.43	1	0.65	0.65	0.064	8
Public Health	8.400	4	1.09	0.77	0.78	7
Individuals & Administration	17.600	15	1.3	0.76	0.284	10

^{***} Correlation is significant at the 0.001 level (2-tailed).

^{**} Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

The empirical conclusions present a compelling argument for the existence of a more robust correlation between anti-US sentiment expressed through tweets and analogous political cartoons, contingent on categories of political subject matter. This interrelation varies considerably as it pertains to the administrations of President Trump (Table 9) and President Biden (Table 10). Upon a control variable implementation accounting for President Trump, the Chisquare test elucidates a statistically significant association between anti-US tweets and political cartoons in military & weapons, human rights, and economy & trade. This intimates that anti-US tweets posted during Trump's term as president exhibit a higher propensity for correlation with corresponding political cartoons addressing the aforementioned issues. A plausible justification as the bedrock of this observation is that the agonistic rhetoric and policy decisions espoused by President Trump in relation to these subjects sparked more vehement responses from political cartoonists and commentators. The amplified representation of anti-US political cartoons throughout President Trump's tenure, particularly within the military, human rights, and the economy, can be attributed to a confluence of salient factors and occurrences eliciting extensive international scrutiny and disapproval. These include the US withdrawal from the Joint Comprehensive Plan of Action and a subsequent reimposition of sanctions on Iran, aggravated regional hostilities; the enlargement of military personnel and resources in quarrelsome territories such as Syria and Afghanistan, alongside combative airstrikes yielding civilian casualties; and President Trump's incendiary language and reciprocal menaces exchanged with North Korea, exacerbating likelihood of a nuclear confrontation

9. Discussion & Conclusion

This research has explored the thematic connection between official Chinese government tweets and the development of anti-US propaganda political cartoons. The findings unveil a noteworthy statistical relationship between the expression of anti-US sentiment in tweets and the content of political cartoons, with variations observed across distinct political subject matter categories and different presidential administrations. This paper explored the reciprocity between Chinese government tweets and published cartoons in state media. The Chinese government's tweets and political cartoons in state media are interconnected in numerous ways. Both function as devices for the CCP to sway public sentiment and reinforce its messaging to its own citizens and the global community. The CCP stringently regulates state

media, and propaganda is created as a decisive governance strategy component. The party, through its propaganda machinery, aspires to sculpt mass opinion to procure support for its policies and retain a hold onto power. The propaganda engine supervises state media, encompassing newspapers, television, and online platforms, and controls the narrative presented to the public. Political cartoons represent one method by which the party and the propaganda ministry solicit state media to mould mass opinion. Cartoons function as an efficacious medium for imparting political messages in a primitive and easily digestible format. Political cartoons in state media allow the party to exploit the narrative, subtly sway domestic and non-domestic audiences, and endorse its policies and ideology.

The theoretical frameworks explored in the academic literature furnish constructive perspectives into the relationship between tweets and political cartoons within the context of the CCP's propaganda efforts. Propaganda theories underscore the role of both tweets and political cartoons as powerful tools for influencing public opinion and advancing agendas. Media effects demonstrates that the Chinese government strategically uses media forms to frame and dictate public debates, and fuels anti-US sentiment. Nye's (2004) soft power theory highlights the broader implications of communication strategies, emphasising their role in projecting China's soft power and shaping global perceptions. Cultural and visual communications imparts a lens through which we can analyse political cartoons as a unique aspect of cultural communication, making use of figures, humour, and visual metaphors to convey political ideas and sentiments.

Nonetheless, this paper is not devoid of its limitations. Employing coding categories in the probe of tweet and cartoon content garnered popularity among scholars endeavouring to glean discernment into intricate political and social issues. Yet, this methodology necessitates elaboration. A primary limitation of categories is reductionism as they are typically extensive and generalised, may lead to an oversimplification of complicated matters. For instance, categorising all economy-related tweets under a solitary group may omit crucial differentiations and subtopics. Consequently, this may impinge on the analysis' validity. Another constraint is that categories embody subjectivity, with divergent analysts potentially ascribing distinct categories to identical content, and can confine analysis' accuracy and cogency, as content interpretation can vary substantially contingent on the assigned genre. Categories may culminate in insufficient coverage of pertinent issues. Different topics may not fit neatly into existing coding categories, resulting in incomplete coverage of significant issues. For example, tweets applied to cultural or religious themes do not always align with any listed categories, leading to an incomplete analysis. The understanding of

tweets or cartoons is heavily dependent on the context presented and may not fully encompass the background or underlying motivations behind the content. Thus, content interpretation may lack profundity and therefore not wholly reflect the intended message. Finally, coding categories may prove insufficient in capturing the emotional or rhetorical impact of the content. These categories recurrently concentrate on the factual content of tweets and cartoons, therefore, they may not fully capture the emotional or linguistic effect of the content, inhibiting the analysis' depth. Leveraging subcategories and applying advanced text analysis techniques within aforementioned coding schemes will help mitigate some limitations observed in the current study. By breaking down broader categories into more granular subcategories, we can gain a more nuanced understanding of the content and themes within tweets and political cartoons. An advanced text analysis methods through natural language processing, and semantic analysis, will deliver more extensive awareness into the tone, sentiment, and contextual distinctions present in both tweets and political cartoons.

Notwithstanding, several avenues of future research merit attention. Subsequent research could explore the reception and impact of anti-US propaganda outflowing from China among diverse audiences. This analysis could explore the manners propaganda messages are construed and received, and the ways they affect dispositions and behaviours. A comparative analysis could be conducted to juxtapose China's anti-US propaganda with that of other nations exposed to disparagement by the Chinese government, including but not limited to Japan's military, the UK government's response to a mounting China threat, and Australia's hardline stance on Chinese expansionism. This analysis could aid in identifying commonalities and dissimilarities in propaganda as a statecraft utensil. Future inquiries should undertake a social media analysis with the objective of investigating how anti-US propaganda is transmitted and amplified. A longitudinal analysis may prove beneficial in monitoring changes in anti-US propaganda usage by the Chinese government over time to study the propaganda messaging evolution in adjusted domestic and international political dynamics.

References

- Ayson, M. E. G. (2022). Visual propaganda in the time of Covid-19: China's image repair in state media political cartoons. *Journal of Media and Information Warfare*, 15(3), 39-53.
- Carter, E. B., & Carter, B. L. (2021). When autocrats threaten citizens with violence: Evidence from China. *British Journal of Political Science*, *52*(2), 671-696. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0007123420000575
- Chu, Y. (2014). Political Cartoons in Contemporary China. *The International Journal of Interdisci-plinary Cultural Studies*, 8(1), 1-9. https://doi.org/10.18848/2327-008X/CGP/v08i01/59369
- DeSousa, M. A., & Medhurst, M. J. (1982). Political cartoons and American culture: Significant symbols of campaign 1980. Studies in Visual Communication, 8, 84-97.
- Diamond, M. (2002). No laughing matter: Post-September 11 political cartoons in Arab/Muslim newspapers. Political Communication, 19(2), 251-272. https://doi.org/10.1080/10584600252907470
- Edney, K. (2012). Soft power and the Chinese propaganda system. *Journal of Contemporary Chi-na*, *21*(78), 899-914. https://doi.org/10.1080/10670564.2012.701031
- Edney, K. (2014). The Globalization of Chinese Propaganda: International Power and Domestic Political Cohesion. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Edwards, J. L. (1993). Metaphors of enmity in Gulf War political cartoons. *The Ohio Speech Journal*, 30, 62-75.
- Ghilzai, S. A. (2020). Exploring Power Politics and Hegemonic Struggles through Semiotic Analysis of Political Cartoons. *European Academic Research*, 8(3), 1354-1372.
- Huang, H. (2015). Propaganda as signaling. *Comparative Politics*, 47(4), 419–444. https://doi.org/10.5129/001041515816103220
- Huang, H. (2018). The pathology of hard propaganda. *The Journal of Politics*, 80(3), 1034–1038. https://doi.org/10.1086/696863
- Huang, Z. A., & Wang, R. (2019). Building a network to "tell China stories well": Chinese diplomatic communication strategies on Twitter. *International Journal of Communication*, 13, 2984-3007.
- Kemnitz, T. M. (1973). The cartoon as a historical source. *The Journal of Interdisciplinary Histo-ry*, 4(1), 81-93. https://doi.org/10.2307/202359
- Langeveld, W. (1981). Political Cartoons as a Medium of Political Communication. *International Journal of Political Education*, 4(4), 343-71.
- Mattingly, D. C., & Yao, E. (2022). How soft propaganda persuades. *Comparative Political Studies*, 55(9), 1569-1594. https://doi.org/10.1177/00104140211047403

- Navasky, V. S. (2013). The art of controversy: Political cartoons and their enduring power. Knopf.
- Nye, J. S. (2004). Soft power: The means to success in world politics. Public Affairs.
- Shambaugh, D. (2007). China's propaganda system: Institutions, processes and efficacy. *The China Journal*, *57*, 25–58. https://doi.org/10.1086/tcj.57.20066240
- Streicher, L.H. (1967). On a Theory of Political Caricature. *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 9(4), 427-445. https://doi.org/10.1017/S001041750000462X
- Walker, R. (2003). Political cartoons: now you see them. *Canadian parliamentary review*, 26(1), 16-21.
- Wedeen, L. (1999). *Ambiguities of domination: Politics, rhetoric, and symbols in contemporary Syria*. University of Chicago Press.
- Xu, G. (1998). The Chinese Anti-American Nationalism in the 1990s. *Asian Perspective*, 22(2), 193–218.